

CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY 2120

MINUTES OF THE SOUTHERN CELL ASSESSMENT PANEL WORKSHOP 6 HELD AT THE HB REGIONAL COUNCIL, DALTON ST, NAPIER, AT 5.00 P.M. ON THURSDAY 25 MAY 2017

PRESENT

Panel Members:

Martin Bates, Tom Evers-Swindell, Mike Harris, Te Kaha Hawaikirangi, Paul Hursthouse, Peter Kay, Brent McNamara, Bruce Meredith, Keith Newman, Aki Paipper, Jagwinder Pannu, Duncan Powell, Maurice Smith, Waylyn Tahuri-Whaipakanga, David Wells, Mark Mahoney, Jamie Thompson.

Observers:

Mark Clews, Craig Goodier, Larry Dallimore, Graeme Hansen, Rod Heaps, Trudy Kilkolly, Bruce Lochhead, Dean Moriarty, Tom Belford.

Facilitation Team:

Peter Beaven (Chair), Simon Bendall, Stephen Daysh, Monique Thomsen (Minutes).

Technical Advisors:

Jonathan Clarke (Tonkin & Taylor), Judy Lawrence, (The Edge Team)

APOLOGIES

Ann Redstone, Jan Seaman, Sarah Owen, Connie Norgate, Gary Clode.

WELCOME AND HOUSEKEEPING MATTERS

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Aki Paipper opened the meeting with a karakia.

DEBRIEF ON COMMUNITY MEETING 17 MAY 2017

The panel discussed the community meeting at the Haumoana Hall on 17 May 2017.

Thank you to those that attended the meeting, the post-it note feedback process worked well and that feedback was attached to the agenda.

The panel provided additional feedback on how the meeting may have gone better; it could have been advertised better, provided with flyers to circulate, billboards & large posters at local shops, there was an issue with the maps showing information 100 years out, suggested it was shown at 2065, unclear legends, the community were not familiar with the MCDA process. Positive comments regarding the material provided.

Discussed ways to improve for the Northern panel's community meeting scheduled for 6 June 2017 at the Westshore Surf Life Saving Club.

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

The minutes of Joint Northern and Southern Supplementary Workshop (27 April 2017) and Workshop 5 (3 May 2017) had been pre-circulated.

Motion

That the Minutes of the Joint Northern and Southern Supplementary Workshop (27 April 2017) be confirmed as a true and correct record.

The motion was moved (Peter Kay), seconded (Brent McNamara) and carried.
There were no matters arising.

Motion

That the Minutes of Workshop 5 (3 May 2017) be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Mike Harris noted that prior to the meeting, he had emailed HB Hazards to request the meeting record of the Haumoana Group report back on page 3 was updated with more detail. Mike read out his proposed changes to the panel and the panel agreed to accept those changes in full.

The motion was moved (Dave Wells), seconded (Martin Bates) and carried.
There were no matters arising.

Stephen Daysh thanked Mike for his input into the minutes which were very important to ensure the integrity of the process.

Dave Wells requested an update from an action in the minutes from the Joint Northern and Southern Supplementary workshop, regarding a commitment from the Edge to provide further information in regards to a query on the government's willingness to contribute financially, with the scale of coastal communities at risk in NZ in the coming decade. Simon Bendall advised that there were questions directed at a technical panel at the supplementary workshop, which TAG were collating the responses to and would circulate to the panels once completed, including a response on this question.

Action: Monique to circulate the complete questions and answers document from the Supplementary Workshop to the panels once compiled.

MCDA APPLICATION AND WORKSHOP UPDATES

Simon Bendall outlined the agenda item which provided an update on MCDA objectives development, MCDA Criteria Development, tailoring an MCDA approach and discussing the updated workshop programme.

At the Northern Panel Workshop 5 it was agreed to update the MCDA objective. The panel discussed the changes made by the Northern panel and agreed to adopt the same wording for their objective.

This now being:

To develop responses to coastal hazards risks that:

- a. Manage our communities' exposure to coastal hazards risks; and
- b. Provide flexibility to respond to hazard risks as they change over time.

It was noted that the Northern panel had made no changes to the 7 draft criteria but had refined the descriptions by removing negative language. Northern panel member Garry Huata agreed to take the draft criteria 6 “*relationship of Maori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu, and other taonga*” back to his marae for further discussion before finalising at workshop 6.

Simon noted that there has been a scoring guide added to the criteria and outlined the two groups TAG had split the criteria into; Technical Assessment Criteria (1-4); and Impact Assessment Criteria (5-7). The panels discussed the criteria and scoring.

Simon outlined the 3 proposals in regards to the recommended scoring and shortlisting for the options against the criteria. Paul and Keith both raised work which has been completed in the Clifton and Cape Coast area. It was agreed that these two options would be provided to Tonkin & Taylor prior to them undertaking the shortlisting process.

Action: Simon to change the scoring guide for the impact criteria from Low/High to Low/Good.
Action: Keith and Paul to provide the work done in Clifton and Cape to Coast to TAG & Tonkin & Taylor for incorporating into the process.

WORKSHOP PROGRAMME UPDATES

Simon Bendall provided an overview of the workshop programme updates. Due to the large number of potential options identified, option combinations and integrating the ‘pathways’ concept to the MCDA methodology, TAG have redesigned workshops 6-8 to respond to those matters in a timely fashion.

It was agreed that workshop 8 would become a full day workshop (rather than an evening workshop), it was noted that workshop 7 and workshop 8 are now full day workshops. The panel discussed time options to hold the meeting; full day, 12.00-8.00pm or a weekend.

Action: Monique to create a doodle poll to circulate to the panel to identify the preferred timing for workshop 8.

Action: Monique to update meeting invites and recirculate.

REPORT ON CULTURAL VALUES ASSESSMENT

Aramanu Ropiha introduced herself to the panel and provided a powerpoint presentation on cultural values, the information compiled to assist the Assessment Panels to “score” options against the cultural criterion as part of the Multi Criteria Decision Analysis process.

Aramanu raised concerns that there was only one cultural criteria. She proposed her draft report goes to a hui-a-hapu so local hapu can consult, review and seek approval before being finalized and presented to the Panels. She also suggested that a wananga is held for panel members.

The Chairman and Stephen thanked Aramanu for her presentation and endorsed the idea of having the report mandated, a hui-a-hapu, marae meetings, and a site visit to cultural sites. The proposal would be discussed at the Coastal Hazards Joint Committee to get their blessing before moving forward.

Action: Raise Aramanu’s proposal at the Joint Committee meeting.

Action: Arrange for hui-a-hapu at Matahiwi and Tangoio Maraes.

Action: Schedule a wananga for Panel Members

REPORT ON SOCIAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT / SOCIAL RETURN ON INVESTMENT

Cerasela Stancu of Maven Consultants introduced herself to the panel and provided a powerpoint presentation on assessing and measuring the social impact of coastal hazards in Cape Coast to East Clive.

Keith Newman advised he had sent an email to the HB Hazards in regards to the issue of how to determine values for the selected options and the costing and who pays for any protection work. Keith suggested an economist be engaged to work alongside the social impacts research from Maven to determine the value of the Cape Coast and East Clive area. Cerasela noted that this information has already been incorporated into this work but did include a number of assumptions and she would welcome further discussion on this.

Action: Cerasela and Keith to discuss further.

It was also noted that the Edge team have recently undertaken a survey of representatives of the wider Hawke's Bay community. The survey was conducted to find out the value people place on the coast, perceptions of coastal issues, perceptions of management options, and involvement in local decision-making about the coast.

Action: copies of both presentations to be provided to the panel.

EDGE EVALUATION SHEET

Evaluation sheets were handed out, with a reminder that the survey was also available for on-line completion.

CLOSING

Aki Paipper closed the meeting with a karakia.

The meeting closed at 8.10 p.m.

AGREED ACTIONS:

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1.	Workshop 6, CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES	Circulate a compiled list of questions and answers from the technical panel from the supplementary workshop.	Monique	In Progress.
2.	Workshop 6, MCDA APPLICATION AND WORKSHOP UPDATES	Change the impact criteria from Low/High to Low/Good.	Simon	Completed.
3.	Workshop 6, MCDA APPLICATION AND WORKSHOP UPDATES	Keith and Paul to provide the work done in Clifton and Cape to Coast to TAG & Tonkin & Taylor for incorporating into the process.	Keith & Paul	Completed.
4.	Workshop 6, WORKSHOP PROGRAMME UPDATES	Create a doodle poll to circulate to the panel to identify the timing for workshop 8.	Monique	Completed.
5.	Workshop 6, WORKSHOP PROGRAMME UPDATES	Update meeting invites and recirculate.	Monique	Completed.
6.	Workshop 6, REPORT ON CULTURAL VALUES ASSESSMENT	Raise Aramanu's proposal at the Joint Committee meeting.	TAG	Completed.
7.	Workshop 6, REPORT ON CULTURAL VALUES ASSESSMENT	Arrange for hui-a-hapu at Matahiwi and Tangoio Maraes.	TAG	Different process in progress.
8.	Workshop 6, REPORT ON CULTURAL VALUES ASSESSMENT	Schedule a wananga for panel members following further discussion with hapu	TAG	In Progress.
9.	Workshop 6, REPORT ON SOCIAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT / SOCIAL RETURN ON INVESTMENT	Cerasela Stancu to provide details of costings / assumptions for review and feedback by Keith and other panel members	Cerasela / Keith	Completed.
10.	Workshop 6, REPORT ON SOCIAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT / SOCIAL RETURN ON INVESTMENT	Circulate copies of Powerpoint presentations by Cerasela and Aramanu to the panel.	Monique	Completed.