

# CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY 2120

## MINUTES OF THE NORTHERN CELL ASSESSMENT PANEL WORKSHOP 5 HELD AT THE HB REGIONAL COUNCIL, DALTON ST, NAPIER, AT 5.00 P.M. ON WEDNESDAY 24 MAY 2017

### PRESENT

#### Panel Members:

Craig Daly, Douglas Dickson, Garry Huata, Steve Loughlin, Mike Penrose, Dorothy Pilkington, Oliver Postings, Martin Rockel, Hoani Taurima, Shaun Thompson-Gray, Michel de Vos.

#### Observers:

Paul Bailey, Mark Clews, Larry Dallimore, Rina Douglas, Craig Goodier, Graeme Hansen, James Minehan, Trudy Kilkolly, Jon Kingsford

#### Facilitation Team:

Peter Beaven (Chair), Stephen Daysh, Monique Thomsen (Minutes).

#### Technical Advisor:

Jonathan Clarke (Tonkin & Taylor), Paul Kench, Susan Owen (The Edge Team).

### APOLOGIES

Russell Moffitt, Ann Redstone, Jan Seaman, Simon Bendall, Mark Levick, Sarah Owen, Connie Norgate, Tim Tinker.

### WELCOME AND HOUSEKEEPING MATTERS

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting, acknowledged members of the Edge team, Jonathan Clark from Tonkin & Taylor and advised Des Ratima had resigned from the panel as Kaumatua. Due to the process being so far through this position will not be replaced. Garry Huata agreed to open the remainder of the Northern cell meetings with a karakia on behalf of the Kaumatua.

Garry Huata opened the meeting with a karakia.

### CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

#### Motion

That the Minutes of Workshop 4 (21 March 2017) be confirmed as a true and correct record. The motion was moved (Martin Rockel), seconded (Douglas Dickson) and carried. There were no matters arising.

#### Motion

That the Minutes of the Joint Northern and Southern Supplementary Workshop (27 April 2017) be confirmed as a true and correct record. The motion was moved (Hoani Taurima), seconded (Douglas Dickson) and carried. There were no matters arising.

## OPTION DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

Stephen/Peter provided an overview on the option development process, 18 discrete options have been identified, each priority unit (Ahuriri/Pandora, Westshore, Bayview, Whirinaki) has a shortlist of recommended options and each of those option has been developed further.

The panels split out into the 4 Priority unit groups to consider the option shortlist recommendations and to confirm which option would go forward for evaluation. It was noted that some recommended options can be used in conjunction with another option in combinations, for example planting.

Stephen encouraged the groups to carefully consider the practicality of options in relation to the unit or sub-unit in question as it would not make sense to just keep options on the table for further development and evaluation just for the sake of having lots of options, if they did not make sense, or if another option that would achieve the same effect was clearly superior.

### Whirinaki

- Oliver Postings reported back on behalf of the group and spoke to each option.
- No options already discarded were put back into the list to reconsider.
- Status Quo was removed from the recommended options due to recent storm events (but later re-added.).
- Uncertainty around Breakwater and Offshore Reef options, water depth and impacts on shellfish/existing reefs may make options impractical. There was a focus on some options only being needed in discrete areas of the unit.

### Bayview

- Oliver Postings reported back on behalf of the group and spoke to each option.
- No options already discarded were put back into the list to reconsider.
- Beach scraping was removed from the recommended options.

### Westshore

- Martin Rockel reported back on behalf of the group and spoke to each option.
- No options already discarded were put back into the list to reconsider.
- Inundation accommodation was removed from the recommended options.
- Final strategy should use a combination of options.

### Ahuriri

- Craig Daly reported back on behalf of the group and spoke to each option.
- No options already discarded were put back into the list to reconsider.
- Inter-tidal renourishment (sand), Beach scraping, Restore shingle crest were removed from the recommended options due to the rock revetment that is a feature along most of the unit. It was also proposed that Planting and Renourishment could only be used effectively in conjunction with other options.
- A request was made to consider an extension to the East Pier Groyne could also be looked at.

### Pandora

- Craig Daly reported back on behalf of the group and spoke to each option.
- No options already discarded were put back into the list to reconsider.
- Planting option removed from the recommended options due to no coastal frontage in unit.

- Seawall removed because only risk is inundation and stopbanks would provide an equivalent solution at a fraction of the cost.
- It was noted that the floodgate option would also require the construction of stopbanks.
- It was proposed that in this case the commercial managed retreat would have very different emotions and drivers compared to residential retreat elsewhere in Hawkes Bay.

It was agreed by the Panel that the next step was to evaluate the confirmed shortlists.

After a discussion on the above, it was raised that Status Quo had been removed from only one priority unit. The panel agreed to keep Status Quo in Whirinaki but when it came to scoring this option it was recognized it would probably receive a low score. Managed Retreat for commercial and industrial areas was raised and it was recognized that there are different options in these areas which could be looked at.

### **MULTI-CRITERIA DECISION ANALYSIS (MCDA)**

Stephen Daysh provided an overview of MCDA, the key aims, features and elements of a successful MCDA process.

The panel discussed the proposed MCDA objective and agreed to the MCDA Objective being;

To develop responses to coastal hazards risks that:

- a. Manage our communities' exposure to coastal hazards risks; and
- b. Provide flexibility to respond to hazard risks as they change over time.

TAG had developed 7 draft criteria which would each receive a weighting by the panel to reflect relative importance. The panel discussed each criteria and provided feedback as follows:

- A common theme in the description had 'option avoids' the panel agreed that the descriptions needed to be more positive or neutral, the criteria 'Relationship of Maori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu and other taonga' required more beefing up and Garry and Hoani would seek guidance from their maraes, and Dorothy suggested some wording for this criteria out of respect which has come from the Heritage NZ bill
- It was noted that the two criterion 'Risk transfer to other locations' and 'Socio-economic impacts' seemed to be working against each other
- It was agreed to remove 'option avoids creating equity issues' from the description of 'Socio-economic impacts' criteria.

Stephen discussed the challenges with assessing and scoring the 7 criteria and suggested that the first 4 criteria due to them being more technical in nature would be best assessed by a technical specialist panel consisting of members from Tonkin & Taylor, the Edge and TAG. This process will be documented by the specialist panel with sufficient detail provided around decisions and scoring, to be reported back to the 2 Coastal panels. The Coastal panels will assess and score the 2 socio-impact criteria categories. This approach was agreed by the panel.

**Action:** Garry and Hoani to consult with their maraes in regard to the criteria 'Relationship of Maori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu and other taonga' between workshop 5 & 6.

**Action:** TAG to finalise the wording of each criteria ahead of being confirmed at workshop 6.

## **WORKSHOP PROGRAMME UPDATES**

Stephen Daysh provided an overview of the workshop programme updates. Due to the large number of potential options identified, option combinations and integrating the 'pathway' concept to the MCDA methodology, TAG have redesigned workshops 6-8 to respond to these matters in a timely fashion.

It was agreed that workshop 8 would become a full day workshop (rather than an evening workshop), it was noted that workshop 7 and workshop 8 are now full day workshops.

**Action:** Monique to update meeting invites and recirculate.

## **COMMUNITY DISCUSSION MEETING**

Scheduled for Tuesday 6 June 2017 between 5:30-7:30 pm at the Westshore Surf Life Saving Club. The 'drop in' session is designed for members of the community to come along and talk to members of the panels about the work they are doing and seek the communities feedback on the shortlisted options and criteria, council staff and technical advisors will be available to assist the panel members. This will follow the same format from the Southern Cell meeting at the Haumoana Hall on 17 May 2017 with the venue set up with 'stations' represented by panel members and technical staff, there will be some improvements and lessons learned from the first meeting; names listed onto the first information board to advise the public who is a panel member, register desk run by a member of the TAG team, name tags, flyers, and signage.

The panels were encouraged to talk to their networks and spread the word that the meeting is scheduled. Council have arranged for newspaper and social media advertising. Dorothy advised she has completed a mail drop to houses along the coast in Westshore and Bayview.

**Action:** panel members to contact Monique if they require hard copies of a flyer.

## **EDGE EVALUATION SHEET**

Evaluation sheets were handed out, with a reminder that the survey was also available for on-line completion.

## **OTHER**

There was a query in regard to the next workshop being on a Friday night, with workshop 6 scheduled for Friday 16 June 2017 at 5:00pm. This has been in other people's diaries for several months so it was agreed while not ideal, we had no option but to continue with this date.

## **CLOSING**

Garry Huata closed the meeting with a karakia.

The meeting closed at 8.01 p.m.

**AGREED ACTIONS:**

<b>Task</b>	<b>Meeting / Agenda Item</b>	<b>Actions</b>	<b>Resp.</b>	<b>Status/Comment</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Workshop 5, MULTI-CRITERIA DECISION ANALYSIS (MCDA)</b>	Garry and Hoani to consult with their maraes in regard to the criteria 'Relationship of Maori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu and other taonga' between workshop 5 & 6.	<b>Garry &amp; Hoani</b>	<b>Completed</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Workshop 5, MULTI-CRITERIA DECISION ANALYSIS (MCDA)</b>	TAG to finalise the wording of each criteria ahead of being confirmed at workshop 6.	<b>TAG</b>	<b>Completed</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Workshop 5, WORKSHOP PROGRAMME UPDATES</b>	Monique to update meeting invites and recirculate the invite for workshop 8 for a full day workshop.	<b>Monique</b>	<b>Completed</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Workshop 5, COMMUNITY DISCUSSION MEETING</b>	Panel members to contact Monique if they require hard copies of a flyer ahead of the Community meeting on 6 June 2017.	<b>All</b>	<b>Completed</b>