



MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

Date: Friday 27 November 2020

Time: 10.00am

Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: Cr Jerf van Beek – HBRC - Chair
Cr Hinewai Ormsby – HBRC
Cr Ann Redstone – HDC
Cr Malcolm Dixon – HDC
Deputy Mayor Annette Brosnan – NCC
Cr Hayley Browne – NCC
Cr Keith Price – NCC
Tania Hopmans – Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust (*via zoom*)
Tania Huata – Mana Ahuriri Trust

Alternates: Cr Alwyn Corban – HDC

In Attendance: Simon Bendall – Traverse Environmental Ltd
Chris Dolley – Asset Management Group Manager, HBRC
Rebecca Ashcroft-Cullen – Communications Advisor, HBRC
Jose Beya – Design Engineer, HBRC
Mark Clews – Principal Advisor: District Development, HDC
Garry Hrustinsky – Investment & Funding Manager, NCC
Gavin Ide – Principal Advisor Strategic Planning, HBRC
A Roets – Governance Administration Assistant

1. Welcome/Apologies/Notices

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting and Hinewai Ormsby opened with a karakia.

Resolution

CLI148/20 That the apologies for Cr Tania Kerr, Bruce Allan (TAG), Peter Paku, Cr Rick Barker and Mayor Sandra Hazlehurst be accepted.

**Ormsby/Redstone
CARRIED**

2. Conflict of Interest Declarations

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

3. Confirmation of Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee meeting held on 16 October 2020

CLI149/20 Resolution

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee meeting held on Friday, 16 October 2020, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and confirmed as a true and correct record.

**Ormsby/Redstone
CARRIED**

4. Actions from Previous Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee

Simon Bendall gave a brief overview and update on the outstanding items only with discussions covering:

Item 1: Tāngata whenua engagement:

- Going forward, it was proposed that updates and progress on engagement with tangata whenua are reported back to the Joint Committee through the “Comms update” report
- Ongoing concerns were raised around the impact of renourishment and risks from coastal erosion of the urupa near Petane Marae.
- Agreed to develop an engagement strategy with support from JC members

Item 2: Long Term Plan Reporting – Coastal Hazards Strategy

- An email was circulated with the proposed wording to all Partner Councils
- Given that no feedback has been received, the “wording” has been taken as accepted will now be rolled out through the Partner Council’s Long Term Plan processes for adoption

Item 5: Public Excluded: Funding Review Appointment of Lead

- This item was discussed in Public Excluded and will be addressed in this meeting for discussions.

Item 6: Project Manager’s Update:

- Managed Retreat report: Have not received a draft report as yet. Once received and reviewed by TAG, it be presented to the Joint Committee for consideration
- The Resource Management Review Panel Report and National Climate Change Risk Assessment for New Zealand reports will be reported on at the next meeting in February 2021.

Item 8: Current Coastal Projects Update:

- Requested information on the preliminary private and public split development.
- TAG considered different options for how costs may be split cost between public and private beneficiaries during the panel process in 2017/2018. In order to report this work to the JC a draft report is in development.
- Presentation to be given at the next meeting in February 2021 around the context

of this work.

Item 9: Assessment Panel supplementary recommendations:

- Work has slowly progressed – some delays were caused due to Covid-19 pandemic
- Letters were circulated to Councils in December 2019 seeking response as raised by the panels as their supplementary recommendations
- Will keep progressing this – Work in progress.

Item 10: Project Manager’s update: Invitation to LGNZ/Minister for the Environment to a future Joint Committee meeting

- Have engaged with LGNZ and still engaging with MfE – work in progress
- It was noted that there is a newly appointed CE of LGNZ who would be valuable in these discussions going forward
- Proposed that this matter be addressed through the Project Manager’s report instead as a follow-up action item.

Other matters:

- A question was raised whether there were any attempts made to improve the age distribution for representation on the Northern and Southern Panel members
- The committee recognise that there is an issue around representation from rangatahi
- The Comms Team has engaged with the Youth Councils from NCC, HDC and HBRC to encourage younger representation on these panels
- Only one member showed interest from the HBRC Youth Environment Council
- It was considered that more focus should be given to get younger generation presentation on the Northern and Southern Panel meeting discussions and workshops.

CLI150/20 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the “*Actions from previous Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee Meetings*” report.

Huata/Redstone
CARRIED

5. Call for Minor Items Not on the Agenda

There were no minor items raised for discussion.

6. Terms of Reference Amendment

Chris Dolley spoke to the item noting that a minor adjustment be made to the Terms of Reference for appointment of an independent facilitator.

- Simon Bendall reported that the Joint Committee has considered the merits of calling on the services of an independent facilitator to assist with complex debates or issues
- The paper presents the recommended amendments for the Joint Committee’s consideration.
- Question was raised whether matters being considered by the Joint Committee may be referred by the Chair’s only or by resolution of the Joint Committee.
- Deliberations and discussions on the wording of the ToR followed
- Final wording contained in the Recommendation below.

CLI151/20 **Resolutions**

That the Joint Committee:

1. Receives and considers the “*Terms of Reference Amendment*” staff report.

2. Agrees that the decisions to be made are not significant under the criteria contained in Council's adopted Significance and Engagement Policy, and that Council can exercise its discretion and make decisions on this issue without conferring directly with the community or persons likely to have an interest in the decision.
3. Recommends an amendment to the Terms of Reference to include a new clause *Independent Facilitation as follows.*

13 Independent Facilitation

- 13.1 *Any matter or matters being considered by the Joint Committee may be referred by the Joint Committee for facilitation.*
- 13.2 *Following a referral made under 13.1, TAG shall develop a report presenting potential candidates and a recommended appointment to provide independent facilitation services. The Joint Committee shall receive and consider the report and confirm an appointment.*
 - *The appointment may be made for a set duration (e.g. for 12 months) or on a task specific basis.*
- 13.3 *The role of independent facilitator is to assist the Joint Committee to consider, debate and reach resolution on specified matters.*
- 13.4 *The independent facilitator shall act in every respect as an independent and neutral third party and shall have no voting or decision-making functions.*

**Brosnan/Dixon
CARRIED**

7. Project Manager's Update

Simon Bendall gave a brief update with discussions covering:

- Tracking against budgets as expected – however mindful of significant expenses coming up in particular for the funding review
- Overall project timeline – still tracking towards the planned consultation process with the broader public in October 2021 but there are some risks to achieving this
- It was noted that the Strategy can't progress without an agreed position on funding – will affect the timeline if no agreement can be reached
- Bus trip to the Southern Panel on 16 October went well. Had great discussions with Graeme Hansen (HDC) on practical matters, consenting, cost and progressing this project forward
- A bus trip to the Northern Panel will be arranged early in the new year
- Proposed to extend invitation to Aramanu Ropiha to attend the next meeting in February 2021.

CLI152/20 Resolution

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the "*Project Managers Update*" report.

**Redstone/Ormsby
CARRIED**

The Chair vacated chair at 10.52am and deputy chair, Annette Brosnan resumed the meeting.

8. Current Coastal Projects Update

Whakarire Ave Revetment Works:

- No NCC representative was available to provide an update given on this work.

Extended consent area for sand deposition at Westshore

- Jose Beya reported that there is no significant update since the last meeting.

- Meetings held with Ngāti Pārau and Māori Stakeholder groups – concerns raised at this meeting will be considered.
- Another meeting will be arranged with the Westshore residents, Fishing Groups, The Surf Club next week where the project will be presented and put forward
- Jon Kingsford, NCC are engaging with other stakeholder groups.
- Consultation with iwi and stakeholder groups to be finalised to proceed with the consenting process.

Haumoana 18

- Mark Clews reported that a letter report has been produced for the H18 section of coast and provides guidance for consideration on available protection options, coastal strategy summary, review of sheet pile protection option, possible alignments, indicative costs and an outline of a staged approach if residents were motivated to proceed.
- Contact has been made with H18 representatives, tentatively suggesting a meeting date with H18 residents of 8 December 2020 to explain detail of the letter report and to consider the next steps.

Capeview corner

- Mark Clews reported that following completion of the affected party consultation process, including immediate adjoining landowners, DOC, Matahiwi and Customary Marine Title applicants, the consent application for this project was lodged with HDC and HBRC on Friday 13 November 2020.
- A site visit has been undertaken with the contractor to confirm and refine contract and budget detail, in preparation for construction in early 2021, subject to successfully obtaining the necessary consents.
- An initial site visit was carried out with HBRC staff on 3 November.

Whirinaki

- No update given.

North Shore Road erosion:

- HDC is assisting local residents with possible minor protection advice for an eroding section of coast adjacent to North Shore Road.
- A letter report has been produced that provided analysis of beach profile data, recent changes, comparison with coastal strategy detail and consideration of possible community mitigation measures.
- Residents have also now been provided with a typical cross section proposing minor reclaim works and planting options for the area and consideration about seeking consents for the proposal.
- The residents contact has been provided with HDC consents advisors contact details should they wish to progress a consent application for the works.

CLI153/20 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the “Coastal Projects Update”

**Price/Browne
CARRIED**

9. Workstream Package – Regulatory Reports

Gavin Ide gave a brief overview on the two regulatory reports undertaken by Mitchell Daysh Limited with discussions covering:

- These reports were presented in draft to the Joint Committee at the 7 August workshop and peer reviewed by Paul Beverly from Buddle Findlay
- The Regulatory workstream is one of several workstreams underway in Stage 4 of the Strategy
- Mitchell Daysh provided some recommendations including considering changes to local planning documents and advocating for changes to the New Zealand

Coastal Policy Statement and also suggests that we continue with advocacy efforts to Central Government

- The Regulatory workstream focussed on two principal tasks such as summarising key planning and regulatory documents to support implementation of the preferred pathway and actions to ensure short-term adaptation responses
- Changes are considered necessary to the NZCPS to better recognise and provide for hard coastal protection structures as a mechanism for managing coastal hazard risk as an interim measure
- It would be prudent to develop a detailed consenting strategy and risk evaluation at the completion of the workstreams identified in the Regulatory report to determine the most effective and efficient pathway forward for each Priority Unit
- Would be helpful if tāngata whenua members of this Joint Committee could support the development of an engagement plan and discussions with wider tāngata whenua and stakeholder groups – early engagement is vital
- Need a well coordinated resourced timeline plan for tāngata whenua to engage effectively
- Further work is required for each priority unit to understand the nature and scale of effects likely to arise as a result of the implementation of each short-term priority unit adaption response.
- A paper will be presented to the next committee on what the workstream looks like going forward and address the actions contained in these two reports and how it could be managed.
- Engage with tāngata whenua members on designing an iwi engagement strategy – book a workshop for early new year to address this.

CLI154/20 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the “*Workstream package – Regulatory reports*” staff report.

**Dixon/Redstone
CARRIED**

10. **Communications and Workshop Update**

Rebecca Ashcroft-Cullen gave an update on the communications and the community workshops being held for the Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee.

Discussions traversed:

- Communication focused on re-engaging with the previous panel members and setting up a series of workshops
- Eight workshops with the community focussing on design, managed retreat and signals, triggers and threshold are being organised to test the TAG’s work over the past 2 years before formal community consultation commences in late 2021
- Strong response received from 25 previous panel members and 5 new members interested
- An online briefing for previous panel members held to recap on the work and clarify on questions raised
- First workshop was held 18 November which covered the design, cost, consent-ability and timeframes
- Next workshop for the Southern cell would be held on 2 December
- A newsletter has been published in the Hawke’s Bay Today in November
- A follow-up newsletter will be published following today’s meeting covering the Funding review and engagement with community etc.

CLI155/20 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the “*Communications and workshop update*” staff report.

Ormsby/Browne

11. Discussion of Minor Matters Not on the Agenda

There were no minor matters for discussion.

12. Appointment of Funding Review Lead

CLI156/20 Resolution

That Hawke’s Bay Regional Council excludes the public from this section of the meeting, being Agenda Item 12 Appointment of Funding Review Lead with the general subject of the item to be considered while the public is excluded; the reasons for passing the resolution and the specific grounds under Section 48 (1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution being:

GENERAL SUBJECT OF THE ITEM TO BE CONSIDERED	REASON FOR PASSING THIS RESOLUTION	GROUNDS UNDER SECTION 48(1) FO THE PASSING OF THE RESOLUTION
Appointment of Funding Review Lead	<p>s7(2)(b)(ii) That the public conduct of this agenda item would be likely to result in the disclosure of information where the withholding of that information is necessary to protect information which otherwise would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information.</p> <p>s7(2)(i) That the public conduct of this agenda item would be likely to result in the disclosure of information where the withholding of the information is necessary to enable the local authority holding the information to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations).</p>	The Council is specified, in the First Schedule to this Act, as a body to which the Act applies.

**Ormsby/Redstone
CARRIED**

13. Confirmation of Public Excluded Minutes of the meeting held on 16 October 2020

CLI157/20 Resolution

That Hawke’s Bay Regional Council excludes the public from this section of the meeting being Confirmation of Public Excluded Minutes Agenda Item 13 with the general subject of the item to be considered while the public is excluded; the reasons for passing the resolution and the specific grounds under Section 48 (1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution being:

GENERAL SUBJECT OF THE ITEM TO BE CONSIDERED	REASON FOR PASSING THIS RESOLUTION	GROUNDS UNDER SECTION 48(1) FOR THE PASSING OF THE RESOLUTION
Funding Review - Process Options	s7(2)(i) That the public conduct of this agenda item would be likely to result in the disclosure of information where the withholding of the information is necessary to enable the local authority holding the information to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations)	The Council is specified, in the First Schedule to this Act, as a body to which the Act applies.
Funding Review - Appointment of Lead	s7(2)(a) That the public conduct of this agenda item would be likely to result in the disclosure of information where the withholding of the information is necessary	The Council is specified, in the First Schedule to this Act, as a body to which the Act applies.

The meeting moved into public excluded session at 11.33am and out of Public Excluded session at 11.41am.

Closure:

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 11.42am on Friday, 27 November 2020.

Signed as a true and correct record.

DATE:

CHAIRMAN: