



## MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

**Date:** Friday 19 August 2016

**Time:** 10.00 am

**Venue:** Council Chamber  
Hawke's Bay Regional Council  
159 Dalton Street  
NAPIER

**Present:** Peter Beaven – Chairman and HBRC  
Christine Scott – HBRC  
Tony Jeffery – NCC  
Faye White – NCC  
Bill Dalton – NCC Alternate Member  
Tania Kerr - HDC  
George Lyons – HDC  
Tania Hopmans – Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust

**In Attendance:** Simon Bendall – Environmental Management Services  
Mike Adye – HBRC  
Craig Goodier – HBRC  
James Palmer – HBRC  
Rina Douglas – HBRC  
Monique Thomsen – HBRC  
Dean Moriarity – NCC  
Richard Munneke – NCC  
Mark Clews – HDC  
Bruce Lochhead, Port of Napier  
Stephen Daysh – Environmental Management Services  
Wayne Mills – Maven Consulting Group

## 1. Welcome/Apologies/Notices

The Chairman welcomed everyone present to the meeting acknowledging this was the last Committee meeting before the Elections in October. He thanked Councillors of the Committee for their work over the past 2 years.

The Chairman acknowledged members of the public and advised the Committee that speaking microphones were to be used.

The Chairman read two articles from the newspaper referring to the July temperatures which were the highest on record and the sea level continuing to rise.

*Apologies for absence were received from*

- Lawrence Yule – HDC
- Wayne Jack – NCC
- Peter Paku – He Toa Takitini
- Fenton Wilson – HBRC Alternate Member
- Ross McLeod – HDC
- James Minehan – NCC
- Shayne Walker – Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust

*Apologies for lateness were received from*

- Tania Kerr – HDC

### CLI33/16 Resolution:

That apologies for absence and apologies for lateness be accepted.

**White/Beaven  
CARRIED**

## 2. Conflict of Interest Declarations

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

## 3. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE HELD ON 2 MAY 2016

### CLI34/16 Resolution:

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee held on Thursday, 2 May 2016, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and were confirmed as a true and correct record.

**White/Lyons  
CARRIED**

## 4. MATTERS ARISING FROM MINUTES OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE HELD ON 2 MAY 2016

Councillor White noted that she had not received a copy of the submission that the Committee made on the proposed Hastings District Council Annual Plan and she sought confirmation that a draft submission had been circulated and subsequently lodged. Councillor Beaven confirmed that a draft had been circulated to the Committee for comment, and advised that due to prior commitments he was unable to attend the Annual Plan meeting to speak to the submission, however Mr Adye had attended on behalf of the Committee.

Councillor White queried when TAG would contact the Insurance Council to discuss the obligations of landowners regarding the release of new coastal hazards information. It was noted that the Insurance Council were presenting to Council staff including TAG members on 1 September 2016 and they would raise the matter at this meeting.

Mr Bendall read through the action items from the 2 May 2016 Committee meeting and provided updates on the status of each item.

## 5. STAGE 2: DRAFT DECISION MAKING FRAMEWORK

Mr Bendall introduced Mr Stephen Daysh to the Committee and provided an overview of the Stage 2: Draft Decision Making Framework report.

Mr Bendall advised the Committee that the report would be presented as a draft report, and that feedback was sought from the Committee on the important principles the draft report outlined. Mr Bendall also noted that TAG had been approached by the Living at the Edge team who were responsible for a workstream under the National Science Challenge, Resilience to Natures Challenges, to identify ways in which their work may be integrated into and benefit the Strategy.

*10:14 am Tania Kerr joined the meeting*

*10:15 am Tania Hopmans joined the meeting*

Mr Daysh provided a powerpoint presentation and Committee members provided feedback on the report.

### CLI35/16 Resolution:

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee:

1. Receives the draft report '**Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy 2120 Stage Two Report: Decision Making Framework**'.
2. Supports TAG to consider opportunities to collaborate with the Living at the Edge team as part of finalising the decision making framework.

**Kerr/Scott  
CARRIED**

*The meeting adjourned at 11.14 am and reconvened at 11.25 am*

## 6. STAGE 2: FUNDING MODEL

Mr Bendall introduced Mr Wayne Mills to the Committee and provided an overview of the Stage 2: Funding Model report which was provided in 2 parts; part 1 being a descriptive summary and recommendations for general use, and part 2 a more detailed analysis of the funding approach and rationale behind it.

Mr Bendall noted that the Committee were being asked to recommend the funding model and the recommendations in the funding model report back to each partner Council. In support of this process, he advised the Committee that TAG had extended an invitation for a workshop with Councillors from the partner Councils on 29 August 2016, to brief them ahead of individual Council decision making on this matter.

Mr Mills provided a powerpoint presentation and Committee members provided feedback on the report. Some changes to the recommendations of the report were made in response to the feedback, and the proposed resolution of the Joint Committee was updated accordingly.

### CLI36/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee endorses the report '**Stage Two – Development of Funding Model and Guideline, 19 August 2016**' and recommends that the following recommendations from Part One of that report be adopted by the Hawke's Bay Regional Council, Hastings District Council and Napier City Council:

That the partner Councils:

#### **Recommendation One**

Advocate for, and be part of, a Local Government Risk Agency-led forum to develop a public / private sector fiscal response to coastal adaptation caused by sea-level rise.

#### **Recommendation Two**

Adopt the principle of a collaborative approach between the partner Councils to future

funding solutions for coastal hazard resilience projects, based on a whole-of-coastline perspective.

#### **Recommendation Three**

Endorse the concept of a Coastal Response Contributory Fund (CRCF) and request Council senior management to develop a working paper for Councils to consider, covering matters including (but not limited to) governance, objectives, ring-fencing of funding, and future scope of operation.

#### **Recommendation Four**

Recognise that social impact on coastal communities arising from coastal resilience projects requires robust consultation, systematic identification of potential outcomes, and measurement of impact using recognised financial proxy methodologies and endorse the adoption of such an approach in future hazard evaluation.

#### **Recommendation Five**

Endorse the concept that the CRCF Governance Group will, amongst other roles, coordinate detailed future applications and approaches to central government for fiscal assistance on specific projects.

#### **Recommendation Six**

Support in principle that larger infrastructure projects should be funded using debt instruments that broadly match the longer lifespan and intergenerational benefit of such projects in preference to relying on current ratepayers.

#### **Recommendation Seven**

Investigate the issue of long term resilience bonds that might be purchased by institutional investors who have a direct interest in coastal hazard management

**Lyons/White  
CARRIED**

*12.35 pm Mayor Dalton exited the meeting*

### **7. GROUND WATER AND SEA LEVEL RISE – HAZARD ASSESSMENT**

Mr Bendall noted that this agenda item had been prepared in response to a question raised at a previous Councillor session on the impacts of increased groundwater levels being caused as a result of sea level rise, and whether or not this should be included within the scope of the Coastal Hazards Strategy. Mr Bendall provided an overview of the potential impacts of sea level rise on coastal groundwater, and noted that when the scope of the Strategy was confirmed in later 2014, that it was agreed to focus on coastal erosion (storm cut, trends, effects of sea level risk), coastal inundation (wave set-up, run-up, overtopping and sea level risk); and tsunamis.

Mr Bendall noted that having considered the matter, TAG's advice is not to include groundwater effects in the scope of the Strategy at this time, however TAG would remain actively involved with the work being undertaken in this area and incorporate it into the Strategy as part of a future review.

#### **CLI37/16 Resolution:**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the ***Ground Water and Sea Level Rise – Hazard Assessment*** report.
2. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee notes that the impact of sea level rise on groundwater levels and associated effects should be incorporated into future reviews of the Strategy.

**Kerr/Jeffery  
CARRIED**

12.37pm Councillor Lyons exited the meeting

## 8. PROJECT MANAGER UPDATE

Mr Bendall outlined the key dates over the coming months which provided an indication of the programme to complete Stage 3.

Mr Bendall provided an overview of the Living at the Edge team who had approached the TAG and were keen to work in support of the Strategy. TAG had met with the Living at the Edge team and had agreed that there was significant potential for mutual benefit through integrating the two projects, but careful planning was required to avoid duplication, complication and confusing messaging for stakeholders and communities.

On 7 October 2016 TAG, Living at the Edge, Tonkin and Taylor, Environmental Management Services and Maven Consulting will attend a full day workshop to map out the programme of work for Stage 3.

### CLI38/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Project Manager Update** report.

Kerr/Hopmans  
CARRIED

## 9. COMMUNICATIONS UPDATE

Mr Bendall provided an update on the communication and consultation undertaken since the last Joint Committee meeting. This included a mail out in mid-May 2016 to all landowners within the new hazard extents for coastal erosion and inundation, two drop in sessions at the beginning of June 2016 in Westshore and Te Awanga, updated hazard information on LIMs for properties within the new hazards extents and engaging with the 7 marae within the Strategy area.

Mr Bendall noted that a simplified mapping tool for hazards extents would shortly be available through the website and the Committee would be notified when available. It was also noted that HBRC are hosting a discussion with the Insurance Council on 1 September.

Mr Bendall noted that ongoing comms were important while there was a pause in Joint Committee activity over the local body election period. Councillor White recommended a substantial article be developed for circulation through local papers that included interviews with Committee members, TAG members and key consultants, updates on what the Committee is doing, where it is going, how it is driven etc. Mr Bendall advised that he would be meeting with HBRC Comms Manager Mr Drew Broadley to discuss additional communications which would be developed over the coming weeks to maintain a public presence for the Strategy between now and later in the year, and that he would work with Mr Broadley on this suggestion.

Committee members discussed other ways of maintaining communication; Committee member Hopmans suggested that signs are displayed at local beaches over the summer period with information of the Strategy and hazards information, and Councillor Jeffery suggested that during Stage 3 further drop in sessions were held to maintain direct communications with the community.

Mr Bendall reminded the Committee that TAG had extended an invitation for a workshop with Councillors from Napier City Council, Hastings District Council and Hawke's Bay Regional Council on 29 August 2016. This was proposed as a follow up to the last session with Councillors on 1 April 2016 in which they discussed the findings of Stage 1 of the strategy. In this session, they would discuss Stage 2, and principally the development of a funding model to guide financial decisions around planned responses to coastal hazards risks.

### CLI39/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Communications Update** report.

**Scott/White  
CARRIED**

## 10. UPDATE OF PROTECTION WORKS AT WHAKARIRE AVENUE

Councillor Scott raised the issue of perception of conflict of interest given her role as Chair of the Hearings Committee.

*12.45 pm Councillor Scott withdrew from the meeting*

Mr Moriarity updated the Committee on the progress to date. Napier City Council have held a series of pre-hearing meetings with submitters who are now in a comfortable position with the resource consent, with most submitters withdrawing their submissions. There is a further meeting to be held with a final submitter and if this is successful this could see the resource consent go through without the need for a Hearing.

### CLI40/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the *verbal Update of Protection Works at Whakarire Avenue* report.

**Kerr/White  
CARRIED**

## 11. UPDATE ON PROPOSED REVETMENT WORKS AT CLIFTON

Mr Clews provided an update on the \$1m the Hastings District Council has set aside in their draft Annual Plan for revetment works at Clifton.

The Committee had submitted to the draft Annual Plan requesting that the allocation of funds be retained in the Plan but not tagged to anything specific, to allow the Coastal Hazards Strategy outcomes to be developed. The Council had acknowledged the submission, and had opted to retain the specific reference to revetment works but with a focus on preparing the necessary information and studies in advance of a resource consent application. New wording was added to the Plan to the effect that the concept should be further developed and costed for later consideration.

### CLI41/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the verbal **Update on Proposed Revetment Works at Clifton** report.

**Kerr/Jeffery  
CARRIED**

## 12. OTHER MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION

### **Port of Napier**

Mr Bruce Lochhead provided an update on the Assessment of Environmental Effects (AEE) being prepared in support of resource consent applications for proposed Port of Napier Capital Works. Applications were 4-6 weeks behind schedule. Mr Lochhead advised they were increasing consultation with stakeholders and working with iwi groups. They plan to hold drop in sessions in the Westshore/Ahuriri areas in late September and working towards lodgment in mid-October.

**Closure:**

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 1.00pm on Friday, 19 August 2016.

Signed as a true and correct record.

DATE: .....

CHAIRMAN: .....

**AGREED ACTION ITEMS**

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1	10 March 2016, Item 4	Cultural values; TAG to work with iwi and marae groups to identify any additional elements at risk.	TAG	– In Progress.
2	19 August 2016, item 5	TAG to take Joint Committee recommendation on Funding Model back to individual Council meetings for adoption.	TAG	–
3	19 August 2016, item 5	TAG to commence work on gathering the necessary information on priority areas to support the Assessment Groups when they commence their work in February 2017, including assessments on social impacts (SROI)	TAG	–
4	19 August 2016, item 9	Notify the Committee when the Mapping Hazard Tool is available on the website	TAG	–
5	19 August 2016, item 9	Debrief the Committee on the discussions held with the Insurance Council on 1 September	TAG	–
6	19 August 2016, item 9	Implement additional communications between now and December to maintain public presence for the Strategy. Consider signs on beaches over summary and further drop in sessions during Stage 3	TAG	–