



MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

Date: Monday 2 May 2016

Time: 10.00 am

Venue: Council Chamber
Hawke's Bay Regional Council
159 Dalton Street
NAPIER

Present: Peter Beaven – Chairman and HBRC
Christine Scott – HBRC
Tony Jeffery – NCC
Faye White – NCC
Bill Dalton – NCC Alternate Member
Tania Kerr - HDC
George Lyons – HDC
Peter Paku – He Toa Takitini

In Attendance: Simon Bendall – Environmental Management Services
Mike Adye – HBRC
Craig Goodier – HBRC
Monique Thomsen – HBRC
Gavin Ide – HBRC
Dean Moriarity - NCC
James Minehan – NCC
Mark Clews – HDC
Stephen Daysh – Environmental Management Services
Wayne Mills – Maven Consulting Group

1. **Welcome/Apologies/Notices**

The Chairman welcomed everyone present to the meeting and acknowledged members of the public and additional presenters to items on the agenda Mr Stephen Daysh and Mr Wayne Mills.

Apologies for absence were received from

Lawrence Yule – HDC

Wayne Jack – NCC

Fenton Wilson – HBRC Alternate Member

Richard Munneke – NCC

Ross McLeod – HDC

Apologies for lateness were received from

George Lyons – HDC

CLI25/16 **Resolution:**

That apologies for absence and apologies for lateness be accepted.

**Kerr/Beaven
CARRIED**

2. **Conflict of Interest Declarations**

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

3. **CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE HELD ON 10 MARCH 2016**

CLI26/16 **Resolution:**

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee held on Thursday, 10 March 2016, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and were confirmed as a true and correct record.

**Kerr/White
CARRIED**

4. **MATTERS ARISING FROM MINUTES OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE HELD ON 10 MARCH 2016**

Councillor Beaven raised one matter from the previous minutes;

Item 9 Other Matters for Discussion – The Hastings District Council Annual Plan; Councillor Beaven noted the \$1m the Hastings District Council has proposed to set aside in their draft Annual Plan for revetment works at Clifton and the request from the Joint Committee that the Technical Advisory Group prepare a submission on behalf of the Joint Committee to respond to this. Mr Bendall responded, and noted that the Technical Advisory Group have discussed this and would circulate a draft to the Committee for their feedback before the submissions period closes on 8 May 2016. Councillor Scott requested that she not receive the draft submission and would abstain from supporting or contributing to the submission given her role as Chair of the Hawke's Bay Regional Council Hearings Committee.

Councillor Lyons joined the meeting

5. **CONFIRMATION OF STAGE ONE OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY 2120**

Councillor Beaven provided an update on the final two Tonkin & Taylor reports completed for

adoption and the outcome of Stage One.

In response to the stakeholder feedback sessions held to discuss the two reports, three submissions were received. Councillor Beaven welcomed the two who wished to speak to their submission. It was noted that the third submitter Ms Dorothy Pilkington Westshore Residents and Development Association Treasurer did not wish to speak and was happy with the response she received, although Ms Pilkington reiterated an interest in the discussion around LIM tagging.

Richard Karn – Westshore Residents and Development Association Chairman

Mr Karn provided feedback on the Tonkin & Taylor reports and LIM Report tagging and was happy with the response he received and spoke to his feedback and the process going forward.

Mr Karn questioned the timing and process of any review of the Regional Coastal Environmental Plan to reflect the new coastal hazards information. Mr Adye and Mr Bendall responded to note that there were no plans to review the current Plan in the next three years, and that at such time as a review takes place, any changes would need to be fully publicly notified and go through the First Schedule process of the Resource Management Act 1991.

Mr Karn raised the process of involving insurance companies and conversations traversed around the processes of notifying or being notified by insurance companies in response to this new information. This is an ongoing conversation, the Technical Advisory Group has had initial discussions with two different insurance companies but had received different answers. The Technical Advisory Group would raise with the Insurance Council and report back to the Committee.

Larry Dallimore

Mr Dallimore provided feedback on sea level rise on the HB gravel coast and stated that he found it hard to relate to the response he received. Mr Dallimore spoke to his feedback relating to the Port of Napier shipping channel, gravel, sand, the Cyclone Pam that occurred in 2015 causing flooding, and noted the Pacific Beach area was not included in the erosion zone.

Mr Dallimore's submission included comments on gravel and sand issue on the beaches, and stated a view that coarse sand would be a better option than pebbles. It was noted that the Port of Napier for many years have dumped sand in specific dumping zones.

In the Tonkin & Taylor reports, modelling was done on the coast with and without renourishment, the effects of this modelling would be explored further in Stage Three.

Further supporting information received from Mr Dallimore was tabled at the meeting for the Committees information.

Councillor Kerr sought confirmation from TAG that all the submission points from the 3 submitters had been incorporated into the reports where possible. Mr Bendall advised that all the submissions had been provided to Tonkin & Taylor directly and that changes had been made in response, particularly around readability / usability by lay persons. Mr Bendall also noted that there were a couple of minor typos in the reports that Tonkin & Taylor had been advised to amend, and suggested that the reports could still be adopted subject to minor typo edits.

CLI27/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee confirm the following Tonkin & Taylor reports forming Stage One of the Strategy as final:
 - 1.1. Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy 2120: Coastal Hazard Assessment. Tonkin & Taylor, May 2016
 - 1.2. Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy 2120: Coastal Risk Assessment. Tonkin & Taylor, May 2016.

6. ADOPTION OF CELL EXTENT FOR STAGE TWO AND STAGE THREE

Mr Bendall introduced Mr Stephen Daysh of Environmental Management Services to the Committee. Mr Daysh outlined the Stage Two decision making process, options for dividing the areas into logical cells and his recommendation on a preferred number and location of cells.

Mr Adye welcomed Mr Wayne Mills of Maven Consulting Group who introduced himself to the Committee and provided an high level overview of the funding model he is working on alongside Mr Daysh, and what would be discussed in a workshop session after the meeting.

The Committee discussed the Assessment Cell Options, the pros and cons outlined in the letter relevant to the number of cells and the stakeholders to be considered for the proposed Assessment Cell Working Party Groups.

Each Committee member discussed their preferred Assessment Cell options being either;

- Option IV (North / Central / South) with three Assessment Cells divided north, centrally and south; or
- Option V (North / South) with two Assessment Cells centrally divided north and south of the Port / Bluff Hill.

It was noted a further discussion is required on the make up of the proposed Working Party Groups, Councils and the Technical Advisory Group to discuss. Mr Daysh did suggest to the Committee that rather than invite or appoint members to the working groups, receiving names from volunteers at community meetings was a robust process that had worked in past projects.

CLI28/16

Resolution:

1. That the Joint Committee adopt the recommended Option V (North / South) as detailed in the letter from Mr Stephen Daysh dated 26 April 2016.

**Scott/White
CARRIED**

7. PROJECT MANAGER UPDATE

Mr Bendall updated the Committee on where the project is currently sitting.

The Tonkin & Taylor reports were adopted earlier in the meeting, and are now considered as information held by Councils and therefore are required to be included on LIMs. LIM wording had been developed by TAG and agreed with Council LIM staff.

A memo had been circulated to Customer Service Managers of each Council to assist front of house staff effectively respond to phone calls or walk ins specifically relating to the new coastal hazards mapping and information, given that the pending mail out and other publicity may stimulate public enquiries. In the first instance all enquires to be directed to the newly refreshed website, www.hbcoast.co.nz which provides access to the new hazards mapping and to background technical information.

Mr Bendall advised a mail out to landowners would be distributed next week, the letter would outline the newly released information and include a summary sheet with information of the hazards in the landowners area. Separate summary sheets had been created for each area along the coast. The letter notifies the landowners of public *'Drop in Sessions'* scheduled for the end of May at a venue in Te Awanga and Westshore, these sessions are for anyone wishing to speak directly to a member of the Technical Advisory Group about this work. If there is the demand, more sessions would be held. Dates and times would be circulated to the Joint Committee.

Councillor Beaven had been in contact with Marae Chairs and had scheduled meetings for the Technical Advisory Group to attend and discuss progress to date. Mr Bendall noted the upcoming scheduled meetings at Maraes and those in the process of being confirmed. General feedback from the meetings which have occurred was good and there was willingness to be involved.

Mr Bendall outlined where we are now; Stage One is now completed. He acknowledged Mr Stephen Daysh's letter outlining the cell extents now adopted for Stage Two, and that Stage Two is now in full swing. The outcome of Stage Two would be presented for adoption by the Joint Committee on 8 August 2016. The financial model component to Stage 2 would be discussed with Mr Wayne Mills further in the workshop. The Committee suggested combining the drop in sessions with Mr Daysh's community meetings to discuss Stage Two but it was confirmed they would be kept separate.

After the Councillor session on 1 April 2016, Mr Bendall noted discussions were held regarding sea level rise and ground water levels. The Technical Advisory Group have discussed this issue and would discuss and investigate further before presenting a recommendation to the Joint Committee on how to address this issue. The Group would firstly look into what work had already been completed and is already planned, and would report back to the Committee on 8 August 2016.

CLI29/16 **Resolution:**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the ***Project Manager Update*** report.

**Jeffery/White
CARRIED**

8. UPDATE OF PROTECTION WORKS AT WHAKARIRE AVENUE

Councillor Scott raised the issue of perception of conflict of interest given her role as Chair of the Hearings Committee.

Councillor Scott withdrew from the meeting

Mr Minehan updated the Committee on the progress to date. Napier City Council are liaising with HBRC on the consent process and there have been meetings with some submitters to explain aspects of the concept design. It is hoped that in the next few weeks draft conditions of consent would be circulated to those submitters who had expressed an interest in them.

CLI30/16 **Resolution:**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the ***verbal Update of Protection Works at Whakarire Avenue*** report.

Received by the Chairman

9. UPDATE ON PROPOSED REVETMENT WORKS AT CLIFTON

Mr Clews provided an update on the \$1m the Hastings District Council has set aside in their draft Annual Plan for revetment works at Clifton.

Mr Clews acknowledged submissions on the draft Annual Plan close 8 May 2016. The Technical Advisory Group would circulate a draft submission to the Joint Committee for comment and submit to the Hastings District Council before 8 May 2016.

CLI31/16 **Resolution:**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the ***verbal Update on Proposed Revetment Works at Clifton*** report.

Received by the Chairman

10. UPDATE ON THE PORT OF NAPIER

Mr Adye updated the Committee on the Port of Napier’s proposed development plans as set out on their website to build a new wharf within its existing boundary at the northern end of the container terminal and phased dredging plan.

CLI32/16

Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives the verbal ***Update on the Port of Napier*** report.

Received by the Chairman

11. OTHER MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION

There were no other matters for discussion.

Closure:

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 11.33 am on Monday, 2 May 2016.

Signed as a true and correct record.

DATE:

CHAIRMAN:

AGREED ACTION ITEMS

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1	27 November 2015, item 7	Complete mail out to landowners within new hazard extents	TAG	– Completed.
2	10 March 2016, Item 4	Cultural values; TAG to work with iwi and marae groups to identify any additional elements at risk.	TAG	– In Progress.
3	10 March 2016, Item 7	Schedule meetings: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stakeholder groups – 31 March Iwi groups – date/s tbc After 2 May, drop in sessions for landowners and the public. 	TAG	– Completed. – Completed. – Completed.
4	10 March 2016, Item 9	TAG to draft a submission on the Hastings District Councils draft Annual Plan and circulate to the Committee for feedback.	TAG	– Completed.
5	2 May 2016, Item 5	TAG to contact the Insurance Council regarding obligations of landowners	TAG	– Insurance Council is presenting to Council staff including TAG members on 1 September 2016.
6	2 May 2016, Item 6	Councils and TAG to discuss the Working Party Group make up and formation TAG to work with Stephen Daysh to develop a recommendation to 8 August 2016 meeting		– Report to 19 August Joint Committee meeting.
7	2 May 2016, Item 7	Advise the Joint Committee of the 'Drop in Sessions' dates and venues	TAG	– Completed.
8	2 May 2016, Item 7	Report back to the Joint Committee on the outcomes of sea level rise and groundwater discussions (from 1 April 2016 Councillor session).	TAG	– Report to 19 August Joint Committee meeting.