

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

Date: Friday 6 March 2015

Time: 12.00 – 3.00pm

Venue: Council Chamber
Napier City Council
231 Hastings Street
NAPIER

Joint Committee Members:

Peter Beaven – HBRC and Chairman
Christine Scott – HBRC
Tania Kerr – HDC
Faye White – NCC
Peter Paku - He Toa Takitini
George Lyons – HDC
Tony Jeffery – NCC
Tania Hopmans – Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust

In Attendance:

Simon Bendall – Environmental Management Services
Mike Adye – HBRC
Monique Hulena – HBRC
Gary Clode – HBRC
Belinda Riley - HBRC
Mark Clews – HDC
Dean Moriarity – NCC
Richard Reinen-Hamill – Tonkin and Taylor
Shayne Walker - Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust

Ex-officio:

Fenton Wilson – HBRC

ITEM 1 WELCOME / INTRODUCTIONS / APOLOGIES

Mr Beaven welcomed everyone to the meeting and stated this was the third Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee meeting. Mr Beaven noted there were some remaining administrative matters to attend to today but that from this point forward the Committee would be focusing on the work of strategy development. Richard Reinen-Hamill is present but has stood out of the room until item 6.

Mr Beaven quoted an article in the newspaper “Climate Change Blamed for War” to the Committee.

Mr Adye introduced Mr Walker to the Committee, who is the new General Manager of Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust and not replacing Ms Hopmans on the Committee.

Apologies were received from

Bill Dalton – NCC

Richard Munneke - NCC

John O’Shaughnessy – HDC

Mike Maguire - HDC

Gavin Ide – HBRC

Joinella Maihi-Carroll – Mana Ahuriri Inc.

Liz Munroe – He Toa Takitini

Wayne Jack – NCC

James Minehan - NCC

Dennis Morgan – HDC

Helen Codlin – HBRC

Liz Lambert – HBRC

Piri Prentice – Mana Ahuriri Inc.

**Kerr/Lyons
CARRIED**

Mr Wilson advised he would exit before 3.00pm.

ITEM 2 MINUTES OF LAST MEETING

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee held on Friday 19 September 2014, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and confirmed as a true and accurate record.

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee held on Friday 5 December 2014, a tracked changed copy having been tabled at the meeting, were taken as read and confirmed as a true and accurate record.

Mr Bendall updated the Committee on the action items of 5 December 2014 meeting.

RESOLUTION(S)

- A. That the minutes of the meeting of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy Joint Committee held on 19 September 2014 be adopted.

**Scott/Lyons
CARRIED**

- B. That the minutes of the meeting of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy Joint Committee held on 5 December 2014 be adopted.

**Scott/Kerr
CARRIED**

ITEM 3 FINAL TERMS OF REFERENCE

The draft Terms of Reference (ToR) was discussed at the meeting on 5 December 2014 and agreed to be adopted subject to a number of agreed changes. TAG members will seek endorsement for the final ToR from their respective Councils as required.

Ms Scott raised a concern in number 3 Partner Council Members regarding alternates. The concern is that alternates attending may not be fully briefed ahead of meetings and may not have enough knowledge to vote on their behalf. After a discussion it was agreed that if a Committee member is unable to attend a meeting it is their responsibility to brief their alternate ahead of the meeting.

Ms Hopmans requested an alteration to the ToR to remove "*before the first Joint Committee meeting*". 4.3 the Tangata Whenua Members are entitled to vote, remove "*Give consideration to the interests of Mana Whenua and/or Tangata Whenua throughout the Strategy area when exercising their vote.*"

Ms Hopmans also raised a concern of the timing the reports are circulated. Mr Adye advised 3 working days beforehand is acceptable and is the minimum required for Committee meetings. Mr Bendall noted the aim is to circulate a week beforehand but that in this case the agenda had been held up while waiting for information to complete it.

It was agreed that Section 4 Tangata Whenua Members be amended.

RESOLUTION(S)

- A. That the Joint Committee adopt the amended Terms of Reference.
B. That the Joint Committee inform each Partner Council to adopt the final Terms of Reference.

ITEM 4 APPOINTMENT OF DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON(S)

The appointment of a Deputy Chairperson was deferred from the 5 December 2014 meeting. It was agreed that the Terms of Reference for the Committee provide for the appointment of two (2) Deputy Chairpersons. Following discussion and nominations, the deputy chairs were confirmed.

RESOLUTION

- A. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy Joint Committee appoint two (2) Deputy Chairpersons.

Ms Kerr nominated George Lyons

**Kerr/Beaven
CARRIED**

Mr Jeffery nominated Faye White

**Jeffery/Beaven
CARRIED**

ITEM 5 COMMITTEE NAME

The Chairman requested that the TAG consider and prepare options for a simplified name for the Committee to assist with public engagement. TAG developed a list of possible names and the two names that were chosen by TAG for consideration by the Committee were: Tomorrow's Coast; and Coastal Action Committee.

The Committee discussed the names and put forward some other suggestions; Coastal Hazards along Tangoio (CHAT), Coastal Mitigation Committee, Coastal Hazards, Coastal Hazards Committee, Coastal Strategy Committee.

Coastal Hazards Committee was agreed and to have the full name in brackets where appropriate so it was identified as Clifton to Tangoio.

RESOLUTION

- A. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy Joint Committee adopt the following name for public engagement purposes:

Coastal Hazards Committee

**White/Kerr
CARRIED**

ITEM 6 PROPOSAL FROM TONKIN AND TAYLOR

Mr Adye introduced the proposal from Tonkin and Taylor (T&T) that was requested by TAG to complete the technical work required to inform strategy development. TAG had previously reviewed and commented on the draft proposal before finalising for presentation to the Committee. The final proposal provides an outline of work, programme and cost estimate for T&Ts input.

TAG highlighted three critical aspects of the proposal which were: Selection of modelling methodology, Understanding and accepting the stated assumptions and Costs.

Selection of modelling methodology; the underlying methodology proposed for describing the extent of coastal hazards is based on best practice. The method is recommended by Envirolink, and has been used by Northland Regional Council and Environment Canterbury; however it is a relatively new method that has not been tested in the Environment Court in the context of coastal hazards. The advice from T&T is that the proposed model is the best method available.

Understanding and accepting the stated assumptions; T&T (with input from TAG) have developed a set of assumptions which will underpin the modelling. These are critical to the technical workstream and are to be discussed and agreed by the Committee.

Costs; T&T have provided an estimate of \$209,000 for this workstream. At the TAG level, agreement has been reached to cost share between the 3 Councils. Each Council will meet their share of the cost from existing budgets, and budget provisions for costs falling in the 2015/16 financial year.

The costs outlined by T&T are higher than expected. T&T have advised that there is the possibility of reducing the cost of Risk Assessment through use of internal Council resource.

Subject to agreement to accept the proposal from the Committee, HBRC will seek agreement from its Tenders Committee to waive the requirements of its procurement policy and accept this proposal without going through a public procurement process.

The Committee discussed the proposal and raised concern on the cost. The Committee also advised that TAG requires a discussion on advice on peer reviewing of the technical outputs with Richard Reinen-Hamill. It was agreed that the recommendations be discussed after Richard has completed his presentation.

Richard Reinen-Hamill (T&T) joined the meeting and tabled a proposal for the technical workstream to assess hazards risks which had been previously reviewed by TAG. Particular attention was given to the proposed methodology for the assessment, which is to use the stochastic method to produce probabilistic hazard forecasts. This is a relatively new technique, and differs from previous hazards assessments undertaken in Hawke's Bay (2004) and many other past assessments around New Zealand, but is considered to be preferable because it can better account for the inherent uncertainty in predicting hazard effects without being overly conservative. While not yet tested in the Environment Court, this methodology is considered current best practice, and has been adopted by Northland Regional Council and Environment Canterbury.

Another key focus area for discussion was the assumptions and limitations section of the T&T report with changes being made to the document in response to direction from the Committee. The updated assumptions as agreed by the Committee were included in the final T&T proposal and are reproduced below:

- *Coastal erosion and hazard assessment for present day is based on a compilation of information sources, empirical and numerical modelling techniques. The most up-to-date information and data will be used at the time of assessment.*
- *Sea Level Rise projections are based on consideration of published information from IPCC (2014) and the MfE (2008) guidance document on coastal hazards and the Komar report.*
- *The extrapolation of trends and the effect of climate change will be done using equilibrium beach profile models which are accepted and proven methods. However, there are limitations of these models that will be set-out in the report (these are the same limitations as set out in the 2004 coastal hazard assessment).*

- *Historic sea level rise rates of 1.7 mm/yr will be deducted from future sea level rise projections on the basis that these are reflected in current trend analysis.*
- *Inundation assessment will be done assuming crest levels remain at present day levels.*
- *Consideration will be given to tectonic rates of change from Geonet information.*
- *The probabilistic approach of assessing erosion hazard is a relatively new technique but is consistent with the direction in Envirolink (2012) guide to good practice for defining coastal hazard zones for setback lines. It has currently been applied for the Northland Region (NRC) and for Canterbury (ECAN).*
- *Building asset information is compiled from a number of sources and is not accurate for site specific assessments. They provide information suitable for a meshblock (1 km²), or regional scale, assessment and evaluation of risk.*
- *Asset values are based on best available information at the time of development of the data base but they may not reflect present day costs or actual replacement costs.*
- *The present study provides the assessment of risk (hazard x consequence) for the situation as it currently is. No scenarios are included for different management options at this stage.*
- *Modelling will assume status quo for sediment supply and will factor in the cessation of gravel extraction at Awatoto and Marine Parade. The continued nourishment at Westshore will be assumed.*
- *All existing council or port owned and operated artificial coastal protection structures and processes (e.g. groynes, sea walls, beach nourishment, etc) will assumed to continue to be maintained to present day standards for the duration of the strategy timeframe i.e. to 2120*

Mr Wilson exited the meeting at 2.00pm.

RESOLUTION(S)

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy Joint Committee:

- Accept in principal the proposal from Tonkin and Taylor to complete the technical work stream required to inform the development of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy.
- Request HBRC to commission Tonkin and Taylor to undertake the work, subject to agreement from their Tenders Committee.
- Note that the costs will be shared between the Partner Councils in accordance with agreements made by appropriate staff.

**Jeffery/Kerr
CARRIED**

ITEM 7 PROJECT TIMELINE AND SCOPE

Following receipt of the proposal from Tonkin and Taylor (T&T) to complete technical work, TAG have updated the Project Timeline from the version presented at the last meeting on 5 December 2014.

The updated Timeline does not change the end delivery date; rather, it incorporates and aligns the proposed technical work stream with other work streams.

TAG meeting dates have been added to the timeline as requested at the last Committee meeting. Attendance of Joint Committee members at TAG meetings was raised. Mr Adye advised the TAG meetings discuss admin matters and agendas. If Richard Reinen-Hamill was to attend a TAG meeting, a workshop will be held instead and Committee members will be invited to attend.

RESOLUTION

- A. That the updated Project Plan for the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy be adopted.

**Lyons/Kerr
CARRIED**

ITEM 8 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT

The Stakeholder Engagement Plan has been updated since 5 December 2014 meeting. A Regional Council staff member who is currently working to receive accreditation from the International Association for Public Participation has reviewed the plan.

A key point to note is the plan covers Stage One of Strategy development only. There is a new Section 7 - Review has been added to this version of the document. Mr Bendall noted that the plan is intended to be a living document – the number of stakeholders and their level of interests and involvement in Strategy development can and should change over time.

TAG are in the process of establishing a website specifically for this Strategy. It will be simple and inexpensive, similar to the site established for the Heretaunga Plains Urban Development Strategy (www.hpuds.co.nz).

TAG also wishes to advise that all stakeholders identified in the Stakeholder Engagement Plan will receive a letter shortly following this Committee meeting advising them of the process and directing them to the website for further information.

Future updates of this Plan will be presented to the Joint Committee.

The Committee discussed the Stakeholders, Ms Hopmans advised Petane Marae should be added to Individual Stakeholder list. Mr Beaven and Mr Adye attended a meeting with Walk on Water (WOW) who have advised they are representing Te Awanga Progressive Association and Haumoana Residents and Ratepayers Association Incorporated, a letter will be distributed requesting confirmation of representation.

Mr Lyons is attending a meeting in Haumoana next week and has requested to be advised if the website is up and running beforehand, he can refer the Group to it.

RESOLUTION

- A. That the updated Stakeholder Engagement Plan for the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy be adopted.

**Lyons/White
CARRIED**

ITEM 9 OTHER MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION

1. Definitions of Resilience and Adaptation.
Mr Bendall tabled definitions of Resilience and Adaptation. At the 5 December 2014 meeting it was requested that definitions be considered for these terms which were part of the overall vision for the Strategy. The definitions will ultimately be included in the glossary of the final strategy document. The proposed definitions were taken from sources; Resilience was from Tonkin and Taylor and Adaptation was from IPCC. Any suggested changes to wording are to be sent to the Secretary.
2. Project Manager Report back from each meeting.

Mr Bendall advised the Committee that the Terms of Reference require the Project Manager to report back to the Committee after each meeting. He sought guidance on what form this report could usefully take, in addition to the minutes. The Committee discussed options and agreed a verbal update focused on timeframes, deliverables and actions be added to the agenda rather than a report prepared by the Project Manager.

AGREED ACTION ITEMS

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1	19 September	Mana Ahuriri Inc to confirm their ongoing involvement	MA	
2	6 March, Item 2	Circulate confirmed copies of 19 September 2014 and 5 December 2014 minutes	MH	Circulated with agenda and papers for 15 May 2015
3	6 March, Item 3	Amend Terms of Reference number 4 Tangata Whenua Members	MH/SB	Completed
4	6 March, Item 3	Terms of Reference to be adopted at 15 May 2015 meeting	MA/SB	Not required
5	6 March, Item 3	Terms of Reference to go to Councils for endorsement	TAG	Councils have agreed that Joint Committee develop its own ToR
6	6 March, Item 6	Paper to go to Tenders Committee re costs on the T&T proposal	MA	Completed
7	6 March, Item 6	TAG to discuss peer review with Richard Reinen-Hamill	TAG	
8	6 March, Item 8	Letters sent to stakeholders advising them they were identified in the plan and advise them of the process.	TAG	Letters sent via post or email – some stakeholders still require contact
9	6 March, Item 8	Add Petane Marae to Stakeholder List	SB	Completed
10	6 March, Item 8	Letter sent to WOW requesting confirmation of representation on TA/Haumoana	TAG	
11	6 March, Item 8	Advise Mr Lyons if website up and running by 11 March 2015	SB	Website went live 7 April 2015
12	6 March, Item 9	Suggestions to the definitions of Resilience and Adaptation to be sent to Secretary.	All	In progress with TAG
13	6 March, Item 9	Add Project Manager Update to the agenda	MH	Completed

CLOSURE

There being no further business the Chairman closed the meeting at 3.03 pm on Friday 6 March 2015.