



Unconfirmed

MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

Date: Tuesday 28 February 2017

Time: 10.00am

Venue: Napier City Council
Main Committee Room
231 Hastings Street
NAPIER

Present: Cr Peter Beaven – HBRC - Chair
Cr Tony Jeffery – NCC – Deputy Co Chair
Cr Tania Kerr _HDC – Deputy Co-Chair
Cr Paul Bailey – HBRC
Cr Larry Dallimore – NCC
Cr Rod Heaps - HDC
Tania Hopmans – Maungaharuru Tangitū Trust
Peter Paku – He Toa Takitini
Terry Wilson - Mana Ahuriri Trust

Alternates:- Cr A Redstone - HDC

In Attendance: Simon Bendall – Mitchell Daysh
Wayne Mills – Maven Consulting Ltd
Nigel Bradley – Maven Consulting Ltd
Mike Adye – HBRC
Graeme Hansen - HBRC
Mark Clews – HDC
Jon Kingsford - NCC
James Minehan – NCC
Dean Moriarity – NCC
Richard Munneke – NCC (Late arrival)
Monique Thomsen - HBRC
Judy Buttery – Governance Administration Assistant

1. Welcome/Apologies/Notices

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the first Joint Committee meeting of 2017 and acknowledged some new members – Terry Wilson replacing Piri Prentice (Mana Ahuriri), Judy Buttery replacing Monique Thomsen (Committee Secretary); and Graeme Hansen who will replace Mike Adye next month. He also welcomed Wayne Mills and his replacement Nigel Bradley to the meeting.

CLI53/17 Resolution

That apologies from Lawrence Yule, Ross MacLeod and Andrew Newman be accepted.

**Kerr/Hopmans
CARRIED**

2. Conflict of Interest Declarations

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

3. Confirmation of Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee Meeting Held on 5 December 2016

CLI54/17 Resolution

Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee held on Monday, 5 December 2016, a copy having been circulated prior to the meeting, were taken as read and confirmed as a true and correct record.

**Dallimore/Kerr
CARRIED**

4. Matters Arising from Minutes of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee Meeting Held on 5 December 2016

There were no matters arising from the minutes.

4. Confirm the Remuneration of Panel Members

Simon Bendall explained that the Terms of Reference made a commitment to pay members where they are not employees attending on behalf of their employers, and this committee was to decide the figure to be paid.

CLI55/17 Resolutions

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee:

1. Receives and notes the **Confirm the Remuneration of Panel Members** report.
2. Approves an honorarium to the value of \$120 per meeting attended, to be paid to full voting Assessment Cell Evaluation Panel members not being paid by their employers, in accordance with and subject to the provisions of the approved Assessment Cell Evaluation Panel Terms of Reference.

**Hopmans/Bailey
CARRIED**

5. Stage Two: Decision Making Framework

Simon Bendall explained the changes that were made to the draft report to align with the pending MfE national guidance document and input from the Living at the Edge team. This included the addition of the Dynamic Adaptive Pathways Planning (DAPP),

Vulnerability Assessment and Real Options Analysis (ROA) methodologies. He is confident that this document is now well aligned. On request he will circulate a copy of the Townsville Report to the committee.

CLI56/17 **Resolutions**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee:

1. Receives and notes the **Stage Two: Decision Making Framework** report.
2. Adopts the *Stage Two Report: Decision Making Framework* as final.

**Jeffery/Kerr
CARRIED**

6. Stage One: Peer Review Update

Simon Bendall explained the reasons for the delay in providing this peer review but was pleased to report that there were no matters in this review that the TAG consider to be a problem.

CLI57/17 **Resolutions**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the Stage One Peer Review Update report, and reconfirms their adoption of all Stage One reports.
2. That the Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee recommends the peer reviewed Stage One reports be presented to the Napier City Council, Hastings District Council and Hawkes Bay Regional Council for their respective adoption.

**Hopmans/Heaps
CARRIED**

7. Stage Two: Funding Model Refresher

Wayne Mills of Maven Consulting Ltd, gave a refresher overview of the funding model approach, highlighting a number of key points:

- There needs to be a way for Councils to collaborate on funding responses to coastal hazards risks
- There needs to be visibility for communities / stakeholders into an organisation whose purpose is to fund coastal hazards adaptation
- Communities need to make some appropriate contribution for future works to reflect intergenerational responsibilities.
- The funding that is put aside for future responses needs to ringfenced and immune to claw back as far as possible
- The funding framework needs to be durable and able to survive through future successive political cycles over a long time frame

The “Coastal Response Contributory Fund” business model he has proposed requires a deed of agreement, so that those funds can be used in the future. It was suggested that legal brains could look at how these funds could be protected from claw back. Some discussion took place as to how this could work, with the example of Hypothecated Funds which could only be spent on specific projects, this could also be good for attracting Central Government funding. It was also noted that if a fund was created through an entity jointly owned by the 3 councils, it would be very difficult for one of those councils to independently seek a claw back of funds or to dismantle the organization. Given the importance of progressing this work, it was suggested that this item be a standing agenda item for future agendas.

CLI58/17 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Funding Model; Refresher Plus Progress Update** report.

Jeffery/Dallimore
CARRIED

8. **Stage Three: Progress Report**

Simon Bendall told the committee that the Assessment Panels were off to a good start, and The Edge team had indicated a positive trend in responses to their workshop evaluation survey which was being conducted with voting members of the panels.

Wayne Mills gave a presentation on his Social Impact Assessment report.

In regard to cultural values assessment, it was noted that the Social Impact Assessment did not address this, and that it was a current gap. Simon Bendall responded that the TAG has sought to engage at marae and taiwhenua level, but acknowledged capacity issues had made this difficult. He also noted that it was not appropriate to rely on the Mana Whenua panel members as the sole contributors to a cultural values impact assessment when options are scored by the panels. TAG were now working to undertake a desktop review of current information, such as Waitangi Tribunal reporting, cultural impact assessments, and other sources, to be completed by an independent contractor. A project brief for this work was being prepared and would be shared with Joint Committee members before being confirmed.

CLI59/17 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Stage Three Progress** report.

Heaps/Dallimore
CARRIED

9. **MOU: TAG and Living At The Edge**

Simon Bendall advised the committee that the intent behind the MOU was to create clear expectations and assist the two teams to work side by side and to address any potential risks. The MOU is awaiting final confirmation from "Living at the Edge". This is an information only item for the Joint Committee.

CLI60/17 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **MOU; TAG and Living at the Edge** report.

Bailey/Hopmans
CARRIED

10. **Project Manager Update**

Most of the Project Update from Simon Bendall had been covered in previous items.

Mike Adye explained that the Winstones - Awatoto consent expires in May 2017 and that it is not expected to be renewed given that no application to renew their consent has been received within the required statutory timeframes. Winstones are likely to continue to work from that site however. No public statement on Winstones future intentions has been made, as Winstones work through their own planning process.

CLI61/17 **Resolution**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Project Manager Update** report.

Dallimore/Jeffery
CARRIED

11. Current Coastal Projects Update

Whakarire Ave Revetment Works

James Minehan explained that the concept design has been approved and Beca were commencing the detailed design for NCC. This is expected to be completed by the end of March. The build is programmed for the next financial year

Port of Napier Capital Works Programme.

Mike Adye told the committee that the capital development plan for Port of Napier was for an additional berth and additional dredging to increase depth of the harbour. It was thought that a resource consent would be applied for in April 2017.

Proposed Revetment Works at Clifton

A letter was tabled at the meeting from Sage Planning regarding the proposed Revetment works at Clifton. This letter, on behalf of Hastings District Council, acknowledged the “Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazard Strategy 2120” and sought written confirmation from the Joint Committee confirming that the position of the committee was not to oppose any consent applications while the strategy was being developed. The Joint Committee agreed that this reflected their position as confirmed in the overarching strategy document which was publicly available. It was agreed that the Chair and TAG would provide a response on behalf of the Joint Committee.

Haumoana Wall

There has been no further progress to report on the Haumoana Wall.

CLI62/17 **Resolutions**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the *verbal Current Coastal Projects Update* report.
2. That the Committee delegates to the TAG and the Chair the task of responding to Sage Planning.

**Hopmans/Jeffery
CARRIED**

12. Other Matters For Discussion

There were no other matters for discussion.

The Chairman took the opportunity make a presentation to Mr Mike Adye who is to retire at the end of March, in thanks for his contribution to this Committee since 2014.

Mr Adye spoke of the tasks ahead in front of the Joint Committee, noted that the input and support from all Councils as led by the Joint Committee was incredibly valuable and important, and wished the members well for the future.

Closure:

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 12.00noon on Tuesday 28 February 2017.

Signed as a true and correct record.

DATE:

CHAIRMAN:

AGREED ACTION ITEMS

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1.	5 December 2016, item 5	<p>Terms of Reference</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Refine the wording as directed by the Joint Committee. – Mana Ahuriri Inc. to approve the updated ToR. – HDC, NCC, HBRC take the ToR to their Councils to be adopted. 	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Completed. – In Progress. – In Progress for March 2017.
2.	5 December 2016, item 7	<p>Stage 2: Decision Making Framework</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Bring to future Joint Committee to adopt. 	TAG	– Completed
3.	5 December 2016, item 8	<p>Stage 2: Funding Model</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Wayne Mills to attend the next Joint Committee meeting to update/refresh Committee. 	TAG	– Completed
4.	5 December 2016, item 9	<p>Stage 3 Briefing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Councillors to determine who is representing their Council on the North and South panels and to advise TAG. – Committee nominated Peter Kay to be on a panel, TAG to follow up. – Clarify/define the roles and protocols of the full/observer/support roles on the panel. – Iwi reps to confirm attendance – Northern: Terry Wilson/Tania Hopmans and Southern: Terry Wilson/Peter Paku. – Tania Hopmans/Peter Paku/Terry Wilson to meet to discuss the cultural sites of significance and advise TAG. 	ALL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Completed. – Completed. – Completed. – Completed. – In Progress.
5.	5 December 2016, item 11	<p>Project Manager Update</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Present coastal inundation peer review findings to future Joint Committee meeting to finalise Stage 1. 	TAG	– Completed
6.	5 December 2016, item 12	<p>Current Coastal Projects Update</p> <p>Whakaririe Ave:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Circulate a copy of the regional consent to the Committee and upload onto website. <p>Clifton:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Provide a photo of the revetment works. <p>Other:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Add Haumoana Wall Update to be reported on at each meeting. 	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Completed. – In Progress. – Completed.
7.	28 February 2017, Item 5	Simon Bendall to circulate a copy Townsville Report to Committee		
8.	28 February 2017, Item 7	Funding Model to be a standing item on all agendas.		
9.	28 February 2017, Item 11	Respond to Sage Planning – TAG and Chair	TAG	Completed Monday 6 March 2017